Halabja, 17 March 1988: Iraq attacked its own citizens with nerve agents. During its war with Iran, enemy soldiers and civilians were frequent targets.
By Richard Stone, in Tehran

n a chilly morning in September 1987, in the waning days of the Iran-Iraq War, an 18-year-old Iranian soldier named Seyed Naser Emadi drove from a battlefield in northwestern Iran to a hospital in Nagadeh, a city a couple hours away. Crammed in the back of his Land Rover were four soldiers, moaning, vomiting, and coughing. "I'll never forget the sound of their breathing," Emadi says. "It was rattling, raspy." The terrified young men did not know what was happening, and Emadi had no idea how to help them.

They complained about the cold, so Emadi rolled up his window. The air in the vehicle became stifling, and a strong chemical odor wafted from the men's uniforms. Emadi grew nauseous and dizzy, but he made it to the hospital. There, he tried to rouse the nearest victim, whose face and hands had large blisters. The young man would not wake up. As Emadi and a hospital aide carried the victim out of the vehicle, a blister on the man's arm burst, and fluid splattered on the back of Emadi's hand. A couple hours later, he felt a burning sensation and his own hand began to blister.

The experience set Emadi on the path to becoming a medical researcher. (He is now a dermatologist at Tehran University of Medical Sciences and a volunteer with Doctors Without Borders.) It also highlighted one of the cruelest practices in the 1980–88 conflict, which also featured child soldiers and trench warfare. For the first time ever on a battlefield, nerve agents including sarin and tabun were unleashed by Iraqi forces. The cruel odor wafted from the men's uniforms. The air in the vehicle became stifling, and a strong chemical odor wafted from the men's uniforms.

With sulfur mustard—the chemical that afflicted Emadi and his passengers.

According to Iran's Foundation of Martyrs and Veterans Affairs (FMVA), the chemical onslaught killed nearly 5000 Iranians and sickened more than 100,000. That doesn't include Iraqi victims: In March 1988, Iraq's forces attacked its own citizens with mustard and nerve agents in Halabja, killing as many as 5000 and wounding 7000.

Sulfur mustard, a family of compounds first used in World War I, left the deepest and most visible scars on survivors of the war. Three decades later, about 56,000 Iranians are coping with lingering health effects from the blistering agent, ranging from skin lesions and failing corneas to chronic obstructive lung disease and possibly cancer, says Tooba Ghazanfari, an immunologist at Shahed University here.

The scale of the atrocities means that Iran has a unique opportunity to study the long-term effects of chemical weapons. Ghazanfari is leading an effort at a dozen research centers across Iran to uncover how wartime mustard exposures wreaked molecular mayhem that, decades later, triggers illnesses and death. "I'm pretty amazed about the scale of exposures and how many people have been followed," says neuroscientist David Jett, director of the Countermeasures Against Chemical Threats (CounterACT) Program at the U.S. National Institutes of Health in Bethesda, Maryland, which is spearheading R&D on several promising methods of neutralizing such agents (see sidebar, p. 22).

The data, some of which are beginning to appear in Western journals, have unavoidable limitations. The Iranian researchers can only estimate the doses that victims absorbed, and complicating the picture is the fact that Iraqi forces sometimes attacked with mustard and nerve agents simultaneously. "That makes it really difficult to determine what's going on," says James Madsen, a physician and lead clinical consultant in USAMRICD's Chemical Casualty Care Division. Still, U.S. researchers say the Iranian findings are pointing to new molecular targets for treating mustard's long-term effects.

So far, Iran has not undertaken a similar study of nerve agent survivors, who also number in the thousands. Based on Japanese victims of sarin attacks by the Aum Shinrikyo doomsday cult in the mid-1990s and U.S. soldiers possibly exposed to sarin...
In a weapons factory on Ōkunoshima, an island in Japan, were exposed to mustard on the job. Studies flagged an elevated lung cancer risk, but failed to shed light on the mechanism of sulfur mustard’s long-term effects, says pharmacologist Jeffrey Laskin, who directs a CounterACT center on chemical weapons countermeasures at Rutgers University’s Robert Wood Johnson Medical School in Piscataway, New Jersey.

Iranian scientists are seeking answers. A decade ago, Ghazanfari and colleagues launched the Sardasht-Iran cohort study, named after a town in the northwest part of the country that was the site of one of the war’s more reprehensible acts.

On 28 June 1987, Iraqi aircraft dropped four 250-kilogram bombs filled with mustard on residential areas of Sardasht. “It was a completely innocent city,” says Mohammad-Reza Vaez Mahdavi, a Shahed University physiologist who studies the survivors. Records show that 8025 of the 12,000-odd residents were exposed. A few dozen—mostly children and elderly—died within hours or days. About 1500 people suffered moderate to severe symptoms, and at least 100 have since succumbed to respiratory failure, Ghazanfari says.

With funding from FMVA, Ghazanfari’s team is tracking the health of 850 male victims, now aged 30 to 70. Most still reside in Sardasht. For a control group, the scientists recruited 150 men of equivalent age in Rabat, a village 15 kilometers from Sardasht. During the war, Rabat was shelled often—but never with chemical weapons. “Both populations endured a lot of stress,” Ghazanfari says. In principle, that allows her team to zero in on illnesses in Sardasht that can’t be chalked up to stress or factors such as diet and economic status, which are similar in Sardasht and Rabat.

The Sardasht survivors have much higher rates of eye and skin disorders. A few have also developed cutaneous T-cell lymphoma at the site of old mustard burns. Emadi says the uncommon skin cancer may also explain mysterious lesions that doctors in the early 20th century noted in World War I mustard victims. But he says that benign skin lesions are far more common in the victims: patches that lack sweat glands or the ability to secrete sebum, resulting in intensely itchy, dry skin that’s susceptible to infection.
**Weapons in waiting**

In the night of 26 October 2002, Russian special forces raided the Dubrova Theatre in Moscow, where terrorists were holding several hundred hostages. They had pumped a narcotic aerosol into the hall, aiming to incapacitate the terrorists. But the vapor was so potent that many hostages lapsed into a coma, and 124 of them died. In a nifty bit of detective work, the Defence Science and Technology Laboratory in Porton Down, U.K., analyzed clothing and urine from three survivors and revealed in 2012 that the narcotic was a combination of two fentanyl derivatives, carfentanil and remifentanil, both far more powerful than morphine.

The botched raid marked the debut of a new chemical weapon, one of many that worry experts. The U.S. Department of Homeland Security has a list of about 100 chemicals that pose a serious risk of being weaponized. Some were tested on animals decades ago, as the United States and other nations raced to acquire new chemical arms. Others are natural toxins that inactivate them and help explain the development of peribronchial fibrosis as well as slightly elevated rates of certain cancers, in particular blood cancers.

In the past, Ghanei says, mustard victims with chronic symptoms were given standard treatments for chronic pulmonary disorders such as asthma: corticosteroids to tamp down inflammation and β2-agonists for smooth muscle relaxation. He and colleagues have found evidence, for example, that methylation of tumor suppressor genes may inactivate them and help explain the development of peribronchial fibrosis as well as slightly elevated rates of certain cancers, in particular blood cancers.

Researchers in the United States are exploring other potential treatments. Drugs that neutralize TNFα might help, Laskin says. Another promising lead came when pediatric pulmonologist Livia Veress of the University of Colorado in Denver and colleagues zeroed in on fibrin clots in rats exposed to mustard. When she dissected the animals, she pulled out of their lungs white clots called casts that looked like “tree branches,” she says. “I realized I’d seen that before”—in children with plastic bronchitis, a rare complication of surgery to repair congenital heart defects. Veress tested a clot-busting drug, tissue plasminogen activator (tPA), in rats exposed to normally lethal mustard doses—they all survived. Her team has since given tPA to seven children with plastic bronchitis, which normally has a mortality rate of up to 60%. “These are really sick kids,” she says. All survived; other hospitals have treated 22 children, all of whom recovered, too. “It’s pretty darn cool,” Veress says. Her team is working toward U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) approval for tPA’s use for plastic bronchitis and next month, they will start testing the drug in pigs to further demonstrate its potential as a sulfur mustard treatment.

Those prospects, although tantalizing, are still on the horizon, and mustard remains a grave concern: In March 2016, the Islamic State group shelled a village in Iraq near Kirkuk with rockets filled with mustard. “It is just as much of a threat now as it was in the Iran-Iraq War,” Madsen says.

**THAT IS EQUALLY TRUE** for the nerve agents, which many nations still stockpile and which were used as recently as last April against civilians and rebel soldiers in Syria.

Syed Abbas Foroutan remembers their grim debut. In March 1984, he was a young army doctor running a unit for treating mustard victims when some soldiers with unusual symptoms were brought in. They were coughing and short of breath, and some were vomiting and drifting in and out of consciousness. It was clear to the doctors that they weren’t dealing with mustard. “We could only say it was not this, not that,” Foroutan says—until he found a symptom common to all the victims: “Their pupils were constricted to pinholes.”

That pointed to a nerve agent. Such weapons form a covalent bond to and inactivate acetylcholinesterase (AChE), an enzyme that breaks down acetylcholine in synapses, thereby regulating levels of the neurotransmitter. A few days later, comatose victims started arriving to the clinic. Foroutan checked their AChE levels—they were near zero. The clincher was that the ill soldiers responded to atropine, which binds to and blocks acetylcholine receptors, reducing the effects of excess levels of the neurotransmitter. That realization was the beginning of a grave challenge for a young doctor fresh out of medical school, says Newmark, who has studied Foroutan’s experiences. “He was the...
world’s first physician to care for battlefield nerve agent casualties.”

Undeterred by charges that it was engaging in a war crime, Iraq repeatedly shelled Iranian forces with tabun, sarin, and a binary form of the agent, cyclosarin. As Iraqi chemists learned to synthesize nerve agents with fewer contaminants and the military became more adroit at delivering them, the attacks became deadlier. Some casualties went “from fully functioning to seizing and comatose in seconds,” Newmark says. Emadi, who witnessed such deaths, calls the victims “chemical martyrs.”

To cope with the more potent threat, Foroutan pumped afflicted patients with massive doses of atropine—up to 10 times the amount that the United States and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization advise, near the threshold where the drug itself becomes toxic. “Foroutan was doing the best he could with what he had,” Madsen says.

The radical treatment paid off, Newmark says. In most nerve agent fatalities, death occurs after the agent binds to enough AChE to block signal transmission from the brain’s respiratory center to the diaphragm, paralyzing the muscle that’s vital for breathing. “It takes fairly high doses of atropine to get into the brain,” Madsen says. “What Foroutan did was intuitive. He gave so much atropine, we think that it started to take care of the [central nervous system] effects.” Newmark puts it this way: “If a soldier got a snoot full of nerve agent, he was lucky to get to Foroutan’s unit.”

But what happened in later years to Foroutan’s patients—and to thousands of others who survived nerve agent attacks—is largely unknown. That frustrates researchers, who would like to follow up on hints that exposure takes a long-term toll.

One clue comes from an episode in the United States, during Prohibition, when doctors started seeing patients with muscle spasms, tingling and numbness in the legs, and, in some cases, paralysis. The cause turned out to be an adulterant, triorthocresyl phosphate, in a bootleg ginger liquor. That compound, like nerve agents, is an organophosphate, and the symptoms that afflicted the “Ginger Jake” drinkers—some 30,000 documented cases—are now known as organophosphate-induced delayed neurotoxicity (OPIDN). The same syndrome affected one victim of the Aum Shinrikyo cult’s sarin terrorism, says Bahie Abou-Donia, a neurologist at Duke University in Durham, North Carolina. “It would not surprise me to see OPIDN in the Iranian survivors,” Madsen says.

There’s firmer evidence, he says, that nerve agents mess with the mind. Studies of the Aum Shinrikyo survivors link exposure “even at really low doses” to symptoms such as nightmares, headaches, drowsiness, confusion, memory deficits, irritability, and depression—a syndrome called organophosphorus-ester-induced chronic neurotoxicity (OPICN). In March 1991, during the Gulf War, tens of thousands of U.S. soldiers may have been exposed to low doses of sarin after the destruction of an Iraqi ammunition dump, says Abou-Donia, a sarin expert. An unknown percentage of cases of the still-controversial Gulf War Syndrome, he says, may in fact be OPICN.

Female volunteers learning to use gas masks in a Tehran mosque in May 1988. In the waning days of the war, Iraq resorted more frequently to bombarding soldiers and civilians with sulfur mustard and nerve agents.

More clarity on the long-term effects of nerve agents will come from a U.S. National Toxicology Program report on sarin. The draft review concludes that sarin’s chronic effects include AChE inhibition, vision and memory problems in people, as well as nerve pathology detailed in animal studies.

The Iranian veterans could yield a more definitive picture. “Whatever comes out of Iran on this,” Newmark says, “will be the best human data that exists.” But so far, no one is gathering it. After the war, Foroutan became a professor—he’s now at Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences here—and has not tracked his former patients. And zeroing in on late nerve agent effects is not simple. “We don’t have reliable information on who was exposed solely to nerve agents,” says Janbazan medical researcher Batool Mousavi, because of the Iraqi practice of bombarding troops with nerve agents and mustard simultaneously or on consecutive days.

Foroutan believes that it’s not too late to delve into the long-term consequences. “We need a Sardasht cohort for nerve cases,” he says. It could even be an international effort, Newmark suggests, if Iran were to set up a collaboration under OPCW’s auspices.

“It’s important to know if neuropathology and resultant long-term effects actually occur in humans,” Jett adds, “before we approach the FDA for approval of a neuroprotectant drug.”

In the heart of Tehran, a modest one-story building is a living memorial to Iran’s chemical weapons victims. Inside the Tehran Peace Museum, exhibits recount the global history of chemical warfare. Chemical victims of the Iran-Iraq War volunteer as doctors, nurses, and dentists to care for fighters wounded in the war. Several years later, they and 31 other young men in his regiment were exposed to mustard near Khorramshahr, a port city on the Persian Gulf, near the Iraqi border. Some of the blistering agent got in his eyes. “I lost my sight for some time,” he says. It came back, but he has had to endure 31 other young men in his regiment were exposed to mustard near Khorramshahr, a port city on the Persian Gulf, near the Iraqi border. Some of the blistering agent got in his eyes. “I lost my sight for some time,” he says. It came back, but he has had to endure four cornea transplantations, and is on a waiting list for a new pair of lungs. He says he has never felt completely well.

Yazdanpanah is keeping the memory alive. And as a subject in Iran’s research efforts, he hopes his experience will benefit future victims of these ghoulish weapons. “The best years of my life,” he says, “were stolen from me.”

Reporting for these stories was supported by the Pulitzer Center on Crisis Reporting.
Chemical martyrs
Richard Stone

*Science* 359 (6371), 20-25.
DOI: 10.1126/science.359.6371.20