

AMERICAN ASSOCIATION
FOR THE
ADVANCEMENT OF SCIENCE

Board of Directors

CHAUNCEY D. LEAKE, *Retiring President, Chairman*
THOMAS PARK, *President*
PAUL M. GROSS, *President Elect*
HARRISON BROWN DON K. PRICE
HENRY EYRING ALFRED S. ROMER
H. BENTLEY GLASS WILLIAM W. RUBEY
MARGARET MEAD ALAN T. WATERMAN
PAUL A. SCHERER, *Treasurer*
DAEL WOLFFLE, *Executive Officer*

Editorial Board

KONRAD B. KRAUSKOPF H. BURR STEINBACH
EDWIN M. LERNER WILLIAM L. STRAUS, JR.
PHILIP M. MORSE EDWARD L. TATUM

Editorial Staff

DAEL WOLFFLE HANS NUSSBAUM
Publisher *Business Manager*

GRAHAM DUSHANE
Editor

JOSEPH TURNER ROBERT V. ORMES
Associate Editor *Managing Editor*

ELLEN E. MURPHY, *Assistant Editor*

NANCY TEIMOURIAN, *Assistant to the Editor*

News: HOWARD MARGOLIS

Book Reviews: SARAH S. DEES

Editorial Assistants: NANCY S. HAMILTON, EDGAR C. RICH, BARBARA SUTHERLAND, CONRAD YUNG-KWAI

Staff Assistants: GENEVIEVE M. KIRBY, PATRICIA D. PADDOCK

Advertising Staff

EARL J. SCHERAGO, *Director*

BERNICE SCHWARTZ, *Production Manager*

Sales: RICHARD L. CHARLES (New York, N.Y., PE 6-1858); C. RICHARD CALLIS (Old Bridge, N.J., CL 4-3680); HERBERT BURKLUND (Chicago, Ill., DE 7-4973); DILLENBECK-GALAVAN (Los Angeles, Calif., DU 5-3991)

SCIENCE, now combined with THE SCIENTIFIC MONTHLY, is published each Friday by the American Association for the Advancement of Science at National Publishing Company, Washington, D.C. SCIENCE is indexed in the *Reader's Guide to Periodical Literature*.

Editorial correspondence should be addressed to SCIENCE, 1515 Massachusetts Ave., NW, Washington 5, D.C. Manuscripts should be typed with double spacing and submitted in duplicate. The AAAS assumes no responsibility for the safety of manuscripts. Opinions expressed by authors are their own and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of the AAAS or the institutions with which the authors are affiliated. For detailed suggestions on the preparation of manuscripts, see *Science* 125, 16 (4 Jan. 1957).

Advertising correspondence should be addressed to SCIENCE, Room 1740, 11 West 42 St., New York 36, N.Y.

Change of address notification should be sent to 1515 Massachusetts Ave., NW, Washington 5, D.C., 4 weeks in advance. Furnish an address label from a recent issue. Give both old and new addresses, including zone numbers.

Annual subscriptions: \$8.50; foreign postage, \$1.50; Canadian postage, 75¢. Single copies, 35¢. Cable address: Advancesci, Washington.

Copyright © 1961 by the American Association for the Advancement of Science.

How To Let Go and Still Hold the Line

Although the demand for mathematics teachers with Ph.D.'s has greatly increased in recent years, the supply, contrary to the familiar economic law, has been diminishing. Enrollment in mathematics courses is growing much faster than total enrollment in college, with the greatest growth in advanced courses. At the same time, although the number of new Ph.D.'s turned out each year has also grown, with so many mathematicians going into government or industry, the number becoming teachers is not even enough to balance annual losses. This surprising situation was reported by Edwin Moise, of Harvard University, in the April issue of the American Mathematical Society's *Notices*. Moise was speaking for a special committee of mathematicians. What is also surprising is that the committee goes on to suggest that the remedy does not necessarily lie in redoing the entire value structure of American society, but in redoing some of the values entertained by the mathematical community.

To get a doctorate in mathematics, the candidate must now pass preliminary examinations and then write a dissertation offering some new and interesting mathematical proofs. The idea behind this procedure is that to teach mathematics you have to be a creative mathematician yourself. The committee questions this assumption. It suggests an alternative program of study in which the creative dissertation is replaced by "a scholarly dissertation which could be historical, critical, or philosophical," with history understood to include very recent history. Such research, it is claimed, would also be sensible preparation for effective teaching and would result in something of value to the mathematical community. To distinguish the new program from the traditional one, there would also be a new graduate degree in mathematics, the Doctor of Arts.

Official groups of the American Mathematical Society and of the Mathematical Association of America have approved these sentiments in principle, but not all mathematicians are so happy about the proposal. Some criticisms are expressed in a letter to the editor in the June issue of the *Notices*. One criticism is that there has not really been a study of why, with B.A.'s in mathematics comparatively plentiful, Ph.D.'s are so scarce, and that such a study might well show that the hurdle is not the dissertation but the preliminary examinations. A second criticism is that the introduction of a new program of study would mean the introduction of class distinctions among mathematicians, with the upper and lower classes regarding each other with condescension on the one side and envy on the other.

The proposal does have a certain appeal, however. In another field, no necessary connection is expected between being a good novelist and being a good teacher of literature. A key question about the proposal is whether its proponents really mean it when they say that the new kind of dissertation would be both preparation for teaching and a contribution to scholarship. If so, then why not accept the new dissertation but drop the idea of a new "Doctor of Arts" degree, and let the Ph.D. degree serve here as well? The number of additional teachers that would result is not known, but the idea would then seem quite worth pursuing. Differences in status we will always have with us. There are differences now regarding universities, supervisory professors, and dissertation topics. But neither these differences nor those between creative and scholarly work need be shouted from roof tops to be appreciated.—J.T.