

Transmission Studies Resume for Avian Flu

Ron A. M. Fouchier,¹ Adolfo García-Sastre,² Yoshihiro Kawaoka,^{3,4*} Wendy S. Barclay,⁵ Nicole M. Bouvier,^{6,2} Ian H. Brown,⁷ Iliaria Capua,⁸ Hualan Chen,⁹ Richard W. Compans,¹⁰ Robert B. Couch,¹¹ Nancy J. Cox,¹² Peter C. Doherty,¹³ Ruben O. Donis,¹² Heinz Feldmann,¹⁴ Yi Guan,¹⁵ Jacqueline M. Katz,¹² Oleg I. Kiselev,¹⁶ H. D. Klenk,¹⁷ Gary Kobinger,¹⁸ Jinhua Liu,¹⁹ Xiufan Liu,²⁰ Anice Lowen,²¹ Thomas C. Mettenleiter,²² Albert D. M. E. Osterhaus,¹ Peter Palese,² J. S. Malik Peiris,²³ Daniel R. Perez,²⁴ Jürgen A. Richt,²⁵ Stacey Schultz-Cherry,²⁶ John Steel,²¹ Kanta Subbarao,²⁷ David E. Swayne,²⁸ Toru Takimoto,²⁹ Masato Tashiro,³⁰ Jeffery K. Taubenberger,³¹ Paul G. Thomas,¹³ Ralph A. Tripp,³² Terrence M. Tumpey,¹² Richard J. Webby,²⁶ Robert G. Webster²⁶

¹Department of Virology, Erasmus Medical Center, 3015GE Rotterdam, Netherlands. ²Department of Microbiology, Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, New York, NY 10029, USA. ³Department of Pathobiological Sciences, School of Veterinary Medicine, University of Wisconsin–Madison, Madison, WI 53711, USA. ⁴Division of Virology, Department of Microbiology and Immunology, The Institute of Medical Science, University Of Tokyo, Minato-ku, Tokyo 108-8639, Japan. ⁵Department of Medicine, Imperial College, London, W2 1PG, UK. ⁶Division of Infectious Diseases, Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, New York, NY 10029, USA. ⁷Virology Department, Animal Health and Veterinary Laboratories Agency, Addlestone, KT15, UK. ⁸Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale delle Venezie, 35020, Padova, Italy. ⁹Harbin Veterinary Research Institute, CAAS, Harbin 150001, China. ¹⁰Influenza Pathogenesis and Immunology Research Center, Emory University, School of Medicine, Atlanta, GA 30322, USA. ¹¹Department of Molecular Virology and Microbiology, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX 77030, USA. ¹²Influenza Division, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA 30333, USA. ¹³Department of Immunology, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital, Memphis, TN 38105, USA. ¹⁴Laboratory of Virology, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Rocky Mountain Laboratories, Hamilton, MT 59840, USA. ¹⁵State Key Laboratory of Emerging Infectious Diseases, School of Public Health, The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR. ¹⁶D.I. Ivanovsky Institute of Virology, Ministry of Public Health, Moscow, Russia. ¹⁷Institut für Virologie, 35043 Marburg, Germany. ¹⁸National Microbiology Laboratory, Public Health Agency of Canada, Winnipeg, Manitoba R3E 3R2, Canada. ¹⁹Department of Preventative Veterinary Medicine, China Agricultural University, Beijing, 100193, China. ²⁰Animal Infectious Disease Laboratory, School of Veterinary Medicine, Yangzhou University, Yangzhou, Jiangsu 225009, China. ²¹Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Emory University School of Medicine, Atlanta, GA 30322, USA. ²²Friedrich-Loeffler-Institut, D-17493 Greifswald–Insel Riems, Germany. ²³Centre of Influenza Research, School of Public Health, The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR. ²⁴Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Maryland, College Park, College Park, MD 20742, USA. ²⁵College of Veterinary Medicine, Kansas State University, Manhattan, KS 66506, USA. ²⁶Department of Infectious Diseases, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital, Memphis, TN 38105, USA. ²⁷Emerging Respiratory Viruses Section, Laboratory of Infectious Diseases, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD 20892–3203, USA. ²⁸Southeast Poultry Research Laboratory, USDA/Agricultural Research Service, Athens, GA 30605, USA. ²⁹Department of Microbiology and Immunology, University of Rochester Medical Center, Rochester, NY 14642, USA. ³⁰Influenza Virus Research Center, National Institute of Infectious Diseases, Tokyo, 208-0011, Japan. ³¹Viral Pathogenesis and Evolution Section, Laboratory of Infectious Diseases, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD 20892–3203 USA. ³²Department of Infectious Diseases, College of Veterinary Medicine, University of Georgia, Athens, GA 30602, USA.

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: kawaokay@svm.vetmed.wisc.edu

In January 2012, influenza virus researchers from around the world announced a voluntary pause of 60 days on any research involving highly pathogenic avian influenza H5N1 viruses leading to the generation of viruses that are more transmissible in mammals (1). We declared a pause to this important research to provide time to explain the public-health benefits of this work, to describe the measures in place to minimize possible risks, and to enable organizations and governments around the world to review their policies (for example on biosafety, biosecurity, oversight, and communication) regarding these experiments.

During the past year, the benefits of this important research have been explained clearly in publications (2–7) and meetings (8–10). Measures to mitigate possible risks of the work have been detailed (11–

13). The World Health Organization has released recommendations on laboratory biosafety for those conducting this research (14), and relevant authorities in several countries have reviewed the biosafety, biosecurity, and funding conditions under which further research would be conducted on the laboratory-modified H5N1 viruses (10, 15–17). Thus, acknowledging that the aims of the voluntary moratorium have been met in some countries and are close to being met in others, we declare an end to the voluntary moratorium on avian flu transmission studies.

The controversy surrounding H5N1 virus transmission research has highlighted the need for a global approach to dealing with dual-use research of concern. Developing comprehensive solutions to resolve all the issues will take time. Meanwhile, H5N1 viruses continue to evolve in nature. Because H5N1 virus transmission studies are essential for pandemic preparedness and understanding the adaptation of influenza viruses to mammals, researchers who have approval from their governments and institutions to conduct this research safely, under appropriate biosafety and biosecurity conditions, have a public-health responsibility to resume this important work. Scientists should not restart their work in countries where, as yet, no decision has been reached on the conditions for H5N1 virus transmission research. At this time, this includes the United States and U.S.-funded research conducted in other countries. Scientists should never conduct this type of research without the appropriate facilities, oversight, and all necessary approvals. We consider biosafety level 3 conditions with the considerable enhancements (BSL-3+) outlined in the referenced publications (11–13) as appropriate for this type of work, but recognize that some countries may require BSL-4 conditions in accordance with applicable standards (such as Canada). We fully

acknowledge that this research—as with any work on infectious agents—is not without risks. However, because the risk exists in nature that an H5N1 virus capable of transmission in mammals may emerge, the benefits of this work outweigh the risks.

References and Notes

1. R. A. M. Fouchier *et al.*, Pause on avian flu transmission research. *Science* **335**, 400 (2012). doi:10.1126/science.1219412 Medline
2. R. A. M. Fouchier, S. Herfst, A. D. Osterhaus, Restricted data on influenza H5N1 virus transmission. *Science* **335**, 662 (2012). doi:10.1126/science.1218376 Medline
3. S. Herfst, A. D. Osterhaus, R. A. Fouchier, The future of research and

- publication on altered H5N1 viruses. *J. Infect. Dis.* **205**, 1628 (2012). [doi:10.1093/infdis/jis257](https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jis257) [Medline](#)
4. Y. Kawaoka, H5N1: Flu transmission work is urgent. *Nature* **482**, 155 (2012). [Medline](#)
 5. H. L. Yen, J. S. Peiris, Virology: Bird flu in mammals. *Nature* **486**, 332 (2012). [Medline](#)
 6. D. M. Morens, K. Subbarao, J. K. Taubenberger, Engineering H5N1 avian influenza viruses to study human adaptation. *Nature* **486**, 335 (2012). [doi:10.1038/nature11170](https://doi.org/10.1038/nature11170) [Medline](#)
 7. A. S. Fauci, F. S. Collins, Benefits and risks of influenza research: Lessons learned. *Science* **336**, 1522 (2012). [doi:10.1126/science.1224305](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1224305) [Medline](#)
 8. World Health Organization (WHO), "Report on technical consultation on H5N1 research issues" (WHO, Geneva, 2012); www.who.int/influenza/human_animal_interface/mtg_report_h5n1.pdf.
 9. National Science Advisory Board for Biosecurity, "March 29–30, 2012 Meeting of the National Science Advisory Board for Biosecurity to review revised manuscripts on transmissibility of A/H5N1 influenza virus: Statement of the NSABB" (2012); http://oba.od.nih.gov/oba/biosecurity/PDF/NSABB_Statement_March_2012_Meeting.pdf.
 10. Gain-of Function Research on Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza H5N1 Viruses: An International Consultative Workshop, Bethesda, MD, 17–18 December 2012; <http://oba.od.nih.gov/oba/biosecurity/meetings/Dec2012/Agenda-Dec-17-18-2012-HHS-Meeting-GOF%20Research-on-HPAI-H5N1.pdf>
 11. A. García-Sastre, Working safely with H5N1 viruses. *mBio* **3**, e00049 (2012). [doi:10.1128/mBio.00049-12](https://doi.org/10.1128/mBio.00049-12) [Medline](#)
 12. M. Imai *et al.*, Experimental adaptation of an influenza H5 HA confers respiratory droplet transmission to a reassortant H5 HA/H1N1 virus in ferrets. *Nature* **486**, 420 (2012). [Medline](#)
 13. S. Herfst *et al.*, Airborne transmission of influenza A/H5N1 virus between ferrets. *Science* **336**, 1534 (2012). [doi:10.1126/science.1213362](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1213362) [Medline](#)
 14. WHO, Influenza, Guidance for adoption of appropriate risk control measures to conduct safe research on H5N1 transmission (2012); www.who.int/influenza/human_animal_interface/biosafety_summary/en/index.html.
 15. Public Health Agency of Canada, Biosafety Advisory: Efficiently Transmissible Engineered Influenza A H5N1 Viruses (2012); www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/lab-bio/res/advi-avis/sbn-asb-2012-01-31-eng.php.
 16. Commissie Genetische Modificatie (COGEM), Publications, 21 March 2012 Letter in response to influenza research Erasmus MC (CGM/111125-04) (2012); www.cogem.net/index.cfm/nl/publicaties/publicatie/brief-nav-influenza-onderzoek-erasmus-mc [in Dutch].
 17. United States Government Policy for Oversight of Life Sciences Dual Use Research of Concern, (2012); http://oba.od.nih.gov/oba/biosecurity/PDF/United_States_Government_Policy_for_Oversight_of_DURC_FINAL_version_032812.pdf.

15 January 2013; accepted 15 January 2013

Published online 23 January 2013

10.1126/science.1235140

Transmission Studies Resume for Avian Flu

Ron A. M. Fouchier, Adolfo García-Sastre, Yoshihiro Kawaoka, Wendy S. Barclay, Nicole M. Bouvier, Ian H. Brown, Ilaria Capua, Hualan Chen, Richard W. Compans, Robert B. Couch, Nancy J. Cox, Peter C. Doherty, Ruben O. Donis, Heinz Feldmann, Yi Guan, Jacqueline M. Katz, Oleg I. Kiselev, H. D. Klenk, Gary Kobinger, Jinhua Liu, Xiufan Liu, Anice Lowen, Thomas C. Mettenleiter, Albert D. M. E. Osterhaus, Peter Palese, J. S. Malik Peiris, Daniel R. Perez, Jürgen A. Richt, Stacey Schultz-Cherry, John Steel, Kanta Subbarao, David E. Swayne, Toru Takimoto, Masato Tashiro, Jeffery K. Taubenberger, Paul G. Thomas, Ralph A. Tripp, Terrence M. Tumpey, Richard J. Webby and Robert G. Webster

published online January 23, 2013

ARTICLE TOOLS

<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/early/2013/01/22/science.1235140>

RELATED CONTENT

<file:/content>

REFERENCES

This article cites 10 articles, 4 of which you can access for free
<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/early/2013/01/22/science.1235140#BIBL>

PERMISSIONS

<http://www.sciencemag.org/help/reprints-and-permissions>

Use of this article is subject to the [Terms of Service](#)

Science (print ISSN 0036-8075; online ISSN 1095-9203) is published by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. The title *Science* is a registered trademark of AAAS.

Copyright © 2013, American Association for the Advancement of Science